

Appendix 3:¹

Research Literatures Dismissed, by Scholar or Media: Some Examples

Most scholars (we hope) do not partake in (false) dismissive reviews. If they are unfamiliar with a research literature or haven't done a literature search, they do not claim or suggest otherwise. Some scholars, however, dismiss entire research literatures habitually, which allows them to flit effortlessly from topic to topic, often implying an expertise in each.

Below are partial lists of research literatures dismissed by some prominent education policy scholars, organized by scholar. The lists are culled from the collection of over a thousand dismissive reviews posted in the online resource, *Dismissive Reviews and Citation Cartels in US Education Policy Research—A List*.¹

Each entry in the lists below represents a dismissed research literature. The scholar in the heading claimed that no previous research had been conducted on the listed topic (or none that was worth considering, anyway).

Regime 1: The Education Establishment Citation Cartel

Daniel M. Koretz, Harvard University and CRESST

There is no previous research (or any that is any good) on ...

- Test score inflation
- Test score-based accountability
- Evaluations of test score-based accountability programs
- Benefits of testing
- Postsecondary characteristics and effects of testing
- Effects of test preparation, test coaching
- Test score inflation with disadvantaged children
- Test scores' limitations for evaluating programs, schools, or educators
- Existence of test score inflation
- Calculating value-added estimates with low-stakes tests
- High quality evaluations of test-based reforms
- Improvements in achievement gaps

¹ Appendix 3 of the book, *The Malfunction of US Education Policy: Elite Misinformation, Disinformation, and Selfishness*, by Richard P. Phelps

Comparing college predictive validities of high school GPAs and tests

College predictive validity of end-of-course tests

College predictive validity of high school summative tests

Test coaching studies using randomly equivalent groups

Motivational effects of high stakes tests

Empirical research on effects of high stakes testing

Experimental studies of score inflation

Embedding less predictable items in tests

Effects of testing and behavioral responses to testing

Test linking with high stakes tests

Studies linking specific behaviors to score inflation

Studies evaluating changes when one high stakes test replaces another

Effect of accountability tests on student achievement

Characteristics of tests that impede or facilitate score inflation

Effect of accountability programs on student achievement and school effectiveness

Varying effects of different approaches to accountability

Comparing effects of various ways of setting targets

Effects of including students with disabilities in testing programs

Relative advantages of reporting test results disaggregated by groups

Effects of subjective measures in accountability

The use of test score data

Public's understanding of tests and score data

Testing-related research in general in public schools

Educators' understanding of testing and test data

Policymakers' understanding of testing and test data

Stakeholders' interpretation of standards-based data

Variations in educators' response to test data

Positive effects from test-based accountability

Drawing from other fields with accountability systems

Data about student performance at the end of high school

Comparative studies of large-scale assessments

The consequences of testing

Teachers' and principals' responses to testing

Systematic data about cheating

Testing regimens that preceded No Child Left Behind

Testing's effects on practice beyond just overall averages

Comprehensive source of information on time devoted to coaching activities

Comprehensive studies of frequency of cheating

The range of test coaching strategies and their effects

The effects of published report cards on parental decision making or
on schools
Data on affirmative action
Effect of affirmative action admissions
Methods for evaluating validity of score gains with high stakes tests
Changes in school grading standards over time
Empirical evidence about grade inflation
Grade inflation over time in secondary schools
Generalizability of gains in scores on high stakes tests
Effects of test format differences on students with disabilities
Approaches to measure long-term trends
Evaluations of 1980s school reforms
Instructional effects of performance assessments

Regime 2: The Education Reform Citation Cartel

Martin R. West, Harvard University

There is no previous research (or any that is any good) on ...

Class size effects
Effect of class size on student outcomes internationally
School district size effects
School size effects
Voucher effects
Inclusion of private schools in school choice studies
Participation in voucher programs
No Child Left Behind effect on school choice
No Child Left Behind effect on curricular choice
Effects of mayoral control of schools
Teacher collective bargaining effects
Evidence of different compensation schemes, working conditions, or
terms of service in states that prohibit bargaining
Non-cognitive skills
Non-cognitive effects on lifetime outcomes
How policy affects non-cognitive skills
Effect of class size on student non-cognitive outcomes
Cost-effectiveness of class-size reductions
Relationship between money spent on education services and
school performance
Relationship between money spent on education services and
school district performance
Effect of school choice on school autonomy
How teachers respond to performance incentives
Relationship between teacher mobility, attrition, and effectiveness

Relationship between teacher job transitions and effectiveness
Principal effects on student achievement
Influence of principal recognition of teacher effectiveness on personnel decisions
Effects of alternative grade configurations in middle and high grades
International comparisons on effects of alternative grade configurations
Effects of online courses on student achievement in K-12
Effects of virtual education
Comparison of parent perceptions of school life across charter, private, public schools
Parent satisfaction with children's schools in charter, private, public
Parent perceptions of charter schools

Frederick M. Hess, American Enterprise Institute

There is no previous research (or any that is any good) on ...

Large-scale research on school reform
How innovation affects policymaking
How public schools respond to competition
How often teachers are sanctioned
Relationship between leadership preparation and school success
Foundations courses and teacher effectiveness
Examination of school district politics and elections
Political competition at the school district level
Factors that determine the election of mayors
What school boards do
Accountability policies
Mayoral takeover effects
Effect of school board appointments vs. elections
District personnel policy changes after right-to-work laws
Arbitration in education labor negotiations
Collective bargaining effects on education
Educational leadership
Content of principal preparation programs

Brian A. Jacob, University of Michigan

There is no previous research (or any that is any good) on ...

Testing policy and dropout rates
Graduation exams and student achievement
Minimum competency testing and student achievement
School-based accountability studies with individual student data
Effects of high-stakes testing
Effects of testing

Existence of high-stakes testing before the 1990s
Existence of city-wide high-stakes testing programs before the 1990s
Achievement effects of grade promotion testing
Impact of public housing or housing vouchers on education
Educators cheating on tests
Factors that predict cheating on tests
Effect of remediation programs
Relationship between self-efficacy and student learning
Correlation of teacher value-added and principal evaluations
Factors education employers consider when hiring or firing
How principals hire and fire teachers
Effect of employment protection on teacher effort
Effect of school accountability policies on other practices
Relationship between school accountability and spending
Relationship between hiring factors and subsequent teacher performance
Test score manipulation by educators
Effect of test score manipulation on student outcomes
Factors that lead educators to cheat on student tests

Matthew M. Chingos, Urban Institute

There is no previous research (or any that is any good) on ...
Teacher responses to performance incentives
Relationship between teacher mobility, attrition, and quality
Correlation of citizen perceptions and government service quality
Citizen perception of public schools and student achievement
How informed parents and public are about local school performance
Effect of individual teachers on student achievement
Downward effects of teacher experience on performance
Studies comparing teacher performance before and after advanced degree
Effectiveness of university teacher preparation programs
Effects of on-the-job training over teaching life cycle
Effects of large-scale class-size reduction policies
Relationship between teacher effectiveness and job transitions
Evidence from a statewide database on correlates of entry into school leadership positions
Principals' effects on student achievement
Influence of administrator's ability to recognize teacher effectiveness on their personnel decisions
Information on instructional materials in use

Studies linking student achievement data to instructional materials used
Evidence on effectiveness of instructional materials in use
Information on which materials are used in which schools
Estimates of testing and assessment system costs
Long term impacts of a private-school voucher award to low-income student
Costs of online instruction and effectiveness
Studies of hybrid instruction effectiveness
Studies comparing online, face-to-face, and hybrid learning
Online learning studies of minimally acceptable quality
Studies of online learning for large introductory courses
Rigorous evidence of learning outcomes from online learning
Long-term impacts of K-12 interventions
Long-term impacts of private school vouchers
How well students learn in college courses
Studies of the structure of teacher retirement benefits
High quality research of impact of fully online courses
Data on instructional products used in most states
Studies of curriculum effectiveness
Evidence on student loan debt
Studies of school superintendents' effects on student achievement
Effects of school district reform on student achievement
Relation of state NAEP performance to demographic changes
Distributional consequences of making college free
Studies of private, non-profit colleges
Studies of the inequality of school availability in school choice schemes
Impact of private school choice program on college enrollment and degree attainment
What matters for college completion
Relationship of college readiness programs and college graduation

Eric A. Hanushek, Stanford University

There is no previous research (or any that is any good) on ...
Trends in socioeconomic achievement gaps
Long run trends in achievement gaps
Studies of test-based accountability and effects of testing
Accountability systems other than those of No Child Left Behind
Role of teacher quality in explaining differences in student performance
Comparative international studies of teacher quality effects
Quantify differences in teacher skills in numeracy and literacy

Evidence on the return to (i.e., earning advantage of) skills in the labor market
Studies following tested students into the labor market
Studies of academic achievement effects in the labor market (a 2001 study is labeled an "early" study)
Studies of the effect of principal quality
Systematic studies of principals' impact on student outcomes
Evidence of teacher quality impact on students with disabilities
Evidence on how to structure teacher incentives
Evidence on effect of accountability on student outcomes
Any school accountability programs prior to the 1980s
Effect of gaming accountability systems
How accountability systems work
Research on outcomes of accountability systems
Explicit descriptions of policies, regulations, and incentives that determine student performance
Experience in the design and operation of accountability systems
How to accumulate knowledge or ways schools can improve
Collateral impact of accountability on efficiency of resource usage
What helps students learn
Research that concentrates on student performance
How to improve student performance
Experience implementing accountability systems based on outcomes
Educational evaluation in general ("evaluation is seldom an integral part of schools today")

Regime 3. The Permanent Education Press

Chalkbeat

Access to gifted programs by SES with national data (2019)
"Credible" national studies of effects of charter schools on racial integration (2019)
Studies of Common Core's effect on learning (2019)
"Clear" benefits of high school exit exams (2019)
Randomized trials of restorative justice in schools (2019)
Effectiveness of new teachers after teaching under supervision (2018)
Student test anxiety (2018)
Effect of familiarity with other students on student attendance (2018)
Effect on students of mid-year departures of teachers (2018)
Suspensions causing poor test scores and graduation rates (2018)
Effect on student teachers learning from especially effective teachers (2018)

Effect of rate of suspensions on classroom order (2018)
Research on test prep (2018)
Frequency of teacher migration compared to other professions (2017)
Rigorous studies of school vouchers (just one in Florida) (2017)

Hechinger Report

Nationwide racial and ethnic breakdown of career education (2021)
Nationwide study of disparities in CTE by race or ethnicity (2021)
National database of academic performance (2021)
Studies on effects of test prep or coaching (2020)
Studies on test score inflation (“willfully ignored”) (2020)
Quality research on the effects of retention in grade (2014)

The 74

Research on tax credit programs (2017)
Effects of restricting suspensions (2017)
Comparative effects on learning of different curricula and textbooks
(2017)
Effects of teacher diversity (2017)
Are teachers “burning out” from testing and evaluation policies?
(2016)
Positive outcomes of exit exams (2016)
Evidence of exit exams improving achievement or wages (2016)
Discussion of exit exams’ stakes for students (2016)
Causes and consequences of test-score manipulation (2016)

¹ Phelps, R. P. (2016+). Dismissive Reviews and Citation Cartels in US Education Policy Research—A List, *Nonpartisan Education Review/Resources*.
<https://nonpartisaneducation.org/Review/Resources/DismissiveList.htm>